PAPERS FOR TALANTA AS WELL AS LARGER MANUSCRIPTS FOR THE SERIES SHOULD BE SENT TO:
J.G. DE BOER, SECRETARY OF THE DUTCH ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND HISTORICAL SOCIETY, C/O VAN DEN
BERGHLAAN 285, 2132 AH HOOFDDORP, THE NETHERLANDS

BACK ISSUES: SINGLE ISSUES FROM THE CURRENT AND PREVIOUS NUMBERS ARE AVAILABLE FROM THE
DUTCH ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND HISTORICAL SOCIETY AT THE CURRENT SINGLE ISSUE PRICE:
NUMBER 16/17 (1984/1985), AVAILABLE
NUMBER 18/19 (1986/1987), AVAILABLE
NUMBER 20/21 (1988/1989), AVAILABLE
NUMBER 22/23 (1990/1991), AVAILABLE
NUMBER 24/25 (1992/1993), AVAILABLE
NUMBER 26/27 (1994/1995), AVAILABLE
NUMBER 28/29 (1996/1997), AVAILABLE
BLACK ATHENA:
TEN YEARS AFTER

Edited by:
Wim M.J. van BINSBERGEN
This volume of TALANTA is a remarkable one, not only because of its contents but also because it is the first under the responsibility of a new team of editors. Due to personal circumstances Fred C. Woudhuizen had to request the Board of the Dutch Archaeological and Historical Society to be discharged from his duties as editor; the Board have, with regret, accepted his resignation. Everyone who has followed the vicissitudes of the Society and of TALANTA knows that the amount of work Woudhuizen has put into both undertakings can hardly be overestimated. The Board wish to express their gratitude to Woudhuizen for his splendid contribution over the years and hope that, in the future, he will be able to make a similar contribution once more.

The Board of the Dutch Archaeological and Historical Society have appointed as TALANTA’s new editor Dr Maarten D. de Weerd, an archaeologist currently holding an appointment at the Institute for Pre- and Protohistorical Archaeology (IPP) of Amsterdam University. Together with Jan P. Stronk, Maarten de Weerd will hold prime responsibility for the contents of the journal.

It occasionally happens that the publication of a scientific work starts an almost world-wide debate among scholars representing a variety of disciplines. The publication by Martin Bernal of Black Athena: The Afroasiatic roots of classical civilization, vol. I: London/New Brunswick 1987, vol. II: London/New Brunswick 1991, has been such an occasion.

Though perhaps less conspicuously, with a substantial time lag, and rather less vehemently, than in Great Britain and the United States of America, the debate on Black Athena has also extended to the Netherlands. In 1996, on June 28th, the African Studies Centre, Leiden — our national research institution for the study of Africa’s past and present — held a one-day conference on controversies originating from Bernal’s provocative points of view. The list of speakers included Martin Bernal himself.

Since one of TALANTA’s main interests has been the archaeology and ancient history of the countries bordering on the Mediterranean, it was only natural that we gladly accepted Professor Wim van Binsbergen’s
offer to publish, in a thoroughly revised and edited form, the papers of this conference in TALANTA. Van Binsbergen has put in a tremendous amount of work organising the conference, and subsequently soliciting, meticulously editing, and producing the material for this volume. He has thus created a collection which articulates both the strengths and the weaknesses of Bernal’s thesis, of the methods by which Bernal has sought to substantiate it, and of the criticism which has been directed at Black Athena since 1987.

We thought fit to concede our editorial prerogatives to Wim van Binsbergen, and to invite him to be guest editor of this special issue, whose contents and form make a fascinating, well-balanced, and timely book — a testimony, among other things, to the relevance of archaeology in the modern world. These features justified a departure from the usual format of TALANTA: the extensive table of contents, and the detailed general index as prepared by its editor’s efforts.

Our own intervention, for this volume, consisted in the kind of general supervision one exercises as a series editor. Not only the guest editor but also the excellent pieces as supplied by the contributors ensured that this task was both pleasurable and rewarding. It is with confidence that we recommend this volume of TALANTA to the readership.

October 1997

Jan P. Stronk
Maarten D. de Weerd
CONTENTS

PREFACE
Jan P. Stronk & Maarten D. de Weerd ................................................................. 5

BLACK ATHENA TEN YEARS AFTER: towards a constructive re-assessment
Wim van Binsbergen ......................................................................................... 11
1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 11
2. Martin Bernal's Black Athena project ....................................................... 19
3. Into Africa? ................................................................................................. 23
4. Ideology and cultural history .................................................................... 28
   4.1. intercontinental interaction ............................................................... 28
   4.2. Afroasiatic roots granted — but must we reduce classical Greek thought to the flotsam of intercontinental diffusion? ................................................................. 29
   4.3. diffusion, subsequent transformative localisation, and the questionable search for origins ................................................................. 35
5. Martin Bernal and the sociology of knowledge ........................................ 38
6. The Black Athena debate ......................................................................... 44
7. Martin Bernal’s epistemology ................................................................... 50
   7.1. a reality out there ............................................................................... 50
   7.2. dogged responses ............................................................................... 52
   7.3. empiricist realism cum political idealism ........................................... 55
   7.4. steering away from, and back to, myth .............................................. 56
   7.5. a way out? ......................................................................................... 60
8. Towards a re-assessment — and beyond ................................................ 62

RESPONSES TO BLACK ATHENA: general and linguistic issues
Martin Bernal ................................................................................................... 65
1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 65
2. Responses to Black Athena ........................................................................ 66
3. Distortions of Black Athena's argument in Black Athena revisited ........ 73
4. African dynamics: Afroasiatic as a key term ............................................ 77
5. Language contact and the formation of the Greek language ................. 81
6. Greek etymologies from Semitic and Egyptian ....................................... 87
7. From Neith to Athena — From Ἐτ (n) Ἱη to Αθήναι ἔ ................................ 91
8. Conclusion ................................................................................................. 98
THE ANCIENT TOPOYMS OF MALLIA: A post-Eurocentric reading of Egyptianising Bronze Age documents
Jan Best ............................................................................................................. 99
  Introduction: The Aryan Model ................................................................. 99
  The evidence from early Cretan seals ..................................................... 108
  A three-sided seal from Crete .................................................................. 108
  A four-sided seal from Mallia ................................................................. 113
  Another four-sided seal from Mallia ....................................................... 115
  Yet another seal from Mallia .................................................................... 117
  A seal from Eastern Crete ........................................................................ 120
  The Pylos evidence .................................................................................. 120
  Towards a Revised Ancient Model ......................................................... 127

ALTERNATIVE MODELS OF INTERCONTINENTAL INTERACTION TOWARDS THE EARLIEST CRETAN SCRIPT
Wim van Binsbergen ..................................................................................... 131
  Introduction ............................................................................................. 131
  Model I. Crete as the supposedly unique geographical locus of transformative localisation of the intercontinental contributions towards the earliest Cretan script ................................................................. 136
  Model II. Byblos and the North Syrian/ South East Anatolian coast as distinct focal points of transformative localisation of the intercontinental contributions towards the earliest Cretan script ......................................................................................... 139
  Conclusion: From Egypt via the Levant, with additional contributions from Anatolia, to Crete ......................................................................................... 143

CONSONANTS IN COLLISION: Neith and Athena reconsidered
Arno Egberts ............................................................................................... 149
  L'histoire se repète .................................................................................... 149
  Teach yourself Egyptian ......................................................................... 150
  How to handle hieroglyphs .................................................................... 151
  Sound methods ....................................................................................... 152
  Brain-teasing Athena .......................................................................... 153
  Small is beautiful .................................................................................. 154
  Dissi-dentals ........................................................................................... 155
  How does house sound? ........................................................................ 157
  The long and the short of it .................................................................... 159
  Black Parthenon ..................................................................................... 159
  Paradigm lost, paradigm regained ........................................................ 161
  An ego-trip to the ancient world ............................................................. 162

RESPONSE TO ARNO EGBERTS
Martin Bernal ............................................................................................. 165
  Introduction ............................................................................................. 165
  From Ἱτ Ὡτ to Athena .............................................................................. 169
  From Pr ῆθν to Parthēnos ........................................................................ 170
PROOF AND PERSUASION IN BLACK ATHENA I: The case of
K.O. Müller
Josine H. Blok........................................................................................................173
Introduction...........................................................................................................173
Conditions of scientific change ........................................................................178
K.O. Müller in Black Athena I..............................................................................182
Assessment (1): Müller’s writing .......................................................................188
  Müller’s alleged rejection of Egypt, dismissal of knowledge
  sustaining the Ancient Model, and lack of scholarly innovation...............190
  Müller’s alleged commitment to racism, notably anti-Semitism...............194
  Representatives of the Ancient Model and of Indophilia as
  Müller’s alleged two enemies.........................................................................196
Assessment (2): Müller’s views on culture.......................................................197
Assessment (3): Secondary literature and language in
  Black Athena I................................................................................................202
  Bernal on race..................................................................................................204
  Bernal on ‘Volk’..............................................................................................205
  Conclusion.......................................................................................................207

RESPONSE TO JOSINE BLOK
Martin Bernal.......................................................................................................209
Chr. Meiners.......................................................................................................210
K.O. Müller: Disagreements with Dr. Blok.........................................................212
Significant errors...............................................................................................213
Conclusion..........................................................................................................216

RETHINKING AFRICA’S CONTRIBUTION TO GLOBAL
CULTURAL HISTORY: lessons from a comparative historical
analysis of mancala board-games and geomantic divination
Wim van Binsbergen............................................................................................219
  1. Introduction..................................................................................................219
  2. Two case studies: geomantic divination and mancala board-
     games in Africa and elsewhere..................................................................222
     2.1. Focus.....................................................................................................222
     2.2. A Neolithic context.............................................................................223
     2.3. Geomantic divination..........................................................................225
     2.4. Mankala..............................................................................................232
     2.5. The special position of North West Africa........................................235
     2.6. The general convergence of geomantic divination and
         mancala.................................................................................................238
  3. Patterns of intercontinental cultural interaction........................................239
  4. ‘Africa’ not a viable unit of scientific analysis but a welcome
     concept in identity formation.....................................................................243
  5. Conclusion: Three tasks ahead of us.........................................................246

NOTE ON CONTRIBUTORS..................................................................................253

GENERAL INDEX.............................................................................................255